

The Robert J. Milano Graduate School of Management and Urban Policy

MH342 Health Policy and the State in Latin America and the Caribbean in the Twentieth Century

Autumn 1998, Tuesdays 5:50-7:40 pm

Faculty: Anne-Emanuelle Birn

Course Description

This course will examine health policy in a variety of Latin American and Caribbean settings from 1900 to the present. Topics to be covered include: the emergence of the (welfare) state and the rise of national health systems beginning in the 1920s; the interplay of political, social, and professional interests in the founding and organization of health ministries and social security institutions; shifting public health paradigms and the structure of health services delivery; the influence of international health and development agencies on the formation of health policy; community participation and the role of non-governmental organizations in health services delivery; the relationship between economic crisis and growing social inequalities and the health of the public; and the impact of the policies of international financial institutions (such as the World Bank and Inter-American Development Bank) upon current health reform strategies, such as privatization and decentralization of health services.

Course Objectives

1. To become acquainted with the scholarship on the history of health policy and politics in a variety of Latin American and Caribbean settings.
2. To develop the ability to view contemporary health policy issues in historical perspective.
3. To understand the major international, national, and local influences upon the development of health policies in Latin America and the Caribbean throughout the 20th century.
4. To hone research, writing, and oral presentation skills.

Course Requirements

- 1) Each student will be responsible for leading class discussion once during the semester.

- 2) Students are asked to carry out two thorough internet searches for Latin American/Caribbean country-specific health care policy information. Please turn in website addresses and downloaded information. The first search is due September 29; the second search is due October 27.
- 3) A 20 to 30 page research paper is due on the last day of class. An outline of the paper will be due on October 20 and students should meet with me periodically through the semester to discuss their paper topics, methodology, and sources.
- 4) In the last third of the semester, students will make a class presentation based on their research paper. Students should prepare a 20 to 30 minute presentation outlining their research questions, findings, and the relevance of their research to current concerns in health policy. Students should also be prepared to address questions from the class.

Grades

Leading class discussion/overall participation	25%
Results of 2 internet searches	15%
Paper outline	10%
Research paper	35%
Paper presentation	15%

Readings

There is no required textbook for this class, but students unfamiliar with the history of Latin America might want to read Tulio Halperin Donghi=s The Contemporary History of Latin America (Duke University Press, 1993), which is on reserve at Bobst Library (4th St. and Washington Square).

The course readings have been divided into 2 sections: ARequired Reading@ and AAdditional Reading.@ Additional readings have been compiled for students who are interested in a particular topic or who are looking for background materials for their research papers. The ARequired@ readings will be held on reserve at Fogelman Library in the basement of 65 5th Ave. Students are responsible for making their own copies of the readings and will be allowed to check out the reading packets for 2 hours at a time. Students interested in the AAdditional Readings@ should search in Bobcat for their availability in the library consortium or see me.

Class Meetings and Reading Assignments

September 8 Introduction and Overview

September 15 Before 1900 - Indigenous, Colonial, and Post-Independence Organization of Health Care in Latin America

Required Reading:

David Arnold, Imperial Medicine and Indigenous Societies, Manchester: Manchester Univ. Press, 1988, pp. 1-26.

George M. Foster, "On the Origin of Humoral Medicine in Latin America," Medical Anthropology Quarterly, 1(1987): 355-393.

plus one of the following:

Ronn F. Pineo, "Misery and Death in the Pearl of the Pacific: Health Care in Guayaquil, Ecuador, 1870-1925" Hispanic American Historical Review, 1990, 70(4):609-637; and Robert Jackson, "Comments," and Ronn F. Pineo, "Response to Robert Jackson," Hispanic American Historical Review, 1991, 71(2):365-373.

Teresa Meade, "Cultural Imperialism in Old Republic Rio de Janeiro: The Urban Renewal and Public Health Project," in Science, Medicine and Cultural Imperialism, Teresa Meade and Mark Walker, eds., New York: St. Martin's Press, 1991, pp. 95-119.

C.A. Escudé, "Health in Buenos Aires in the Second Half of the Nineteenth Century," in: Social Welfare, 1850-1950: Australia, Argentina and Canada Compared D.C. Platt, ed. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1989, pp. 60-70.

Additional Reading:

Guenter B. Risse. "Medicine in New Spain," in Medicine in the New World, New Spain, New France and New England, Ronald Numbers, ed. Knoxville: The Univ. of Tennessee Press, 1987. pp. 12-63.

Donald B. Cooper, Epidemic Disease in Mexico City, 1716-1813: An Administrative, Social, and Medical Study, Austin: University of Texas Press, 1965.

Lilia V. Oliver Sánchez, El Hospital de San Miguel de Belén, 1581-1802, Guadalajara: Universidad de Guadalajara, 1992.

Suzanne Austin Alchon, Native Society and Disease in Colonial Ecuador, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.

September 22 Health Policy and the State

Required Reading:

Theda Skocpol and Edwin Amenta, AStates and Social Policies,@ Annual Review of Sociology 1986, 12:131-157.

Milton I. Roemer, ATypes of Health Systems and their Determinants,@ in National Health Systems of the World by Milton I. Roemer, Oxford University Press, 1991, pp. 83-99.

and for the ambitious...

John W. Meyer, John Boli, and George M. Thomas, AWorld Society and the Nation-State,@ American Journal of Sociology 1997, 103(1).

October 6 The Origins of Health and Social Security Systems in Latin America**Required Reading:**

Carmelo Mesa-Lago, Social Security in Latin America: Pressure Groups, Stratification, and Inequality, University of Pittsburgh Press, 1978, Introduction and Chapter 5, AThe Case of Argentina,@ pp. 3-21 and 160-207.

Patricio Márquez and Daniel Joly, AA Historical Overview of the Ministries of Public Health and the Medical Programs of the Social Security Systems in Latin America,@ Journal of Public Health Policy 1986 (7):378-394.

Milton Roemer, AMedical Care and Social Class in Latin America,@ Milbank Memorial Fund Quarterly 1964, (42):Part I:54-64.

Vicente Navarro, AThe Underdevelopment of Health or the Health of Underdevelopment: An Analysis of the Distribution of Human Health Resources in Latin America,@ in Imperialism, Health and Medicine, edited by Vicente Navarro, Farmingdale, NY, Baywood Publishing Company, 1981, pp. 15-36.

Additional Reading:

Juan Cesar García, "La Medicina Estatal en América Latina, 1880-1930," Revista Latinoamericana de Salud 1980, (1): 70-110.

Gilberto Hochman, ARegulando os Efeitos da Interdependência Sobre as Relações entre Saúde Pública e Construção do Estado (Brasil 1910-1930),@ Estudos Históricos 1993,

6(11):40-61.

Susana Belmartino, Carlos Bloch, Ana Virginia Persello y María Isabel Camino. Corporación Médica y Poder en Salud, Argentina, 1920-1945. Buenos Aires: Organización Panamericana de la Salud, 1988.

Susana Belmartino, Carlos Bloch, María Isabel Camino, y Ana Virginia Persello, Fundamentos Históricos de la Construcción de Relaciones de Poder en el Sector Salud, Argentina, 1940-1960. Buenos Aires: Organización Panamericana de la Salud, 1991.

Olga Palmero Zilvetti. "La Seguridad Social y la Atención de la Salud en América Latina," Revista Mexicana de Ciencias Políticas y Sociales 1981, (27): 181-202.

Francisco José Yepes et al., La Salud en Colombia: Análisis Socio-Histórico, Bogotá: Ministerio de Salud, 1990.

October 13 The New Public Health: Imperialism and Local Responses

Film: Maria Candelaria (1943)

Required Reading:

Judith Walzer Leavitt, "'Typhoid Mary' Strikes Back: Bacteriological Theory and Practice in Early Twentieth-Century Public Health," Isis, 1992, 83: 608-629.

Anne-Emanuelle Birn. "A Revolution in Rural Health?: The Struggle over Local Health Units in Mexico, 1928-1940." Journal of the History of Medicine and Allied Sciences, 1998, 53(1):43-76.

Marcos Cueto. "Indigenismo and Rural Medicine in Peru: The Indian Sanitary Brigade and Manuel Nuñez Butrón." Bulletin of the History of Medicine. 65 (1991): 22-41.

Additional Reading:

Christopher Abel, AExternal Philanthropy and Domestic Change in Colombian Health Care: The Role of the Rockefeller Foundation, ca. 1920-1950, @ Hispanic American Historical Review 75(1995):339-376.

Annette Ramírez de Arellano, AThe Politics of Public Health in Puerto Rico: 1926-1940, @ Revista de Salud Pública de Puerto Rico, 3(1981):35-58.

Marcos Cueto, "Sanitation from Above: Yellow Fever and Foreign Intervention in Perú, 1919-1922." Hispanic American Historical Review 72 (1992): 1-22

Miguel E. Bustamante, AThe Coordination of Federal and Local Health Services as a Factor of Sanitary Progress in Mexico, @ in Health Services Research: An Anthology, Kerr L. White et al., editors, Washington, D.C.: Pan American Health Organization, Scientific Publication No. 534, 1992, pp. 8-15, translated from the original article in Spanish published in Gaceta Médica de México 1934, 30(5):741-754.

October 20 The Three C=s--Chile, Costa Rica, Cuba

Required Reading (at least one article on each country):

APHA Task Force on Chile, AHistory of the Health Care System in Chile, @ American Journal of Public Health, 1977, 67(1):31-36.

Jorge Jimenez de la Jara and Thomas Bossert, AChile=s Health Sector Reform: Lessons from Four Reform Periods, @ Health Policy 1995, 32:155-166.

Howard Waitzkin and H. Modell, AMedicine, Socialism, and Totalitarianism: Lessons from Chile, @ New England Journal of Medicine 1974, 291:171-177.

Howard Waitzkin, AHealth Policy and Social Change: A Comparative History of Chile and Cuba, @ Social Problems 1983, 31:235-248.

Sally Guttmacher and Ross Danielson, AChanges in Cuban Health Care: An Argument Against Technological Pessimism, @ International Journal of Health Services 1977, 7(3):383-400.

Julie M. Feinsilver, Healing the Masses: Cuban Health Politics at Home and Abroad, Berkeley, CA, University of California Press, 1993, Chapters 2-4, pp. 26-121.

Peter Schwab, ACuban Health Care and the U.S. Embargo,@ Monthly Review 1997, 49(6):15-26.

AThe Politics of Suffering: The Impact of the U.S. Embargo on the Health of the Cuban People,@ Report of a Fact-Finding Trip to Cuba, June 6-11, 1993, Washington, D.C., American Public Health Association, 1993.

ACosta Rica@ in Good Health at Low Cost, Scott Halstead, Julia Walsh, and Kenneth Warren, eds., New York: The Rockefeller Foundation, 1985.

Additional Reading:

Salvador Allende, La Realidad Médico-Social Chilena, Santiago: Ministerio de Salubridad, 1939.

S. Reichard, AIdeology Drives Health care reform in Chile,@ Journal of Public Health Policy, 1996, 17(1):80-98.

October 27 The English Caribbean: Paradox or Mirage?

Required Reading:

G.E. Cumper, AJamaica: A Case Study in Health Development,@ Social Science and Medicine, 1983, 17(24):1983-1993.

AAnnual Report of the Chief Medical Officer for 1990,@ Ministry of Health, Barbados, 1993.

ADevelopment Plan, 1993-2000,@ Ministry of Health, Barbados, 1993.

Pan American Health Organization, Health Conditions in the Americas, Washington, D.C., 1998; see individual country entries in printed or web version.

and for a comparative perspective:

Linda M. Whiteford, AA Question of Adequacy: Primary Health Care in the Dominican Republic,@ Social Science and Medicine 1990, 30(2):221-226.

November 3 Community Participation and Targeted Policies--Illusion or Solution?

Required Reading (any three of the following):

Xavier Solórzano and Michael Bamberger, A Targeting Health and Nutrition Programs for the Poor in Latin America, @ Pan American Health Organization/World Bank unpublished manuscript, 1994.

Tom Frieden and Richard Garfield, A Popular Participation in Health in Nicaragua, @ Health Policy and Planning 1987, 2(2):162-170.

Antonio Ugalde, "Ideological Dimensions of Community Participation in Latin American Health Programs," Social Science and Medicine 1985, (21): 41-53.

David Werner, "Health for No One by the Year 2000," Talk presented at the National Council on International Health Conference, Washington, D.C., June 1989.

Lynn M. Morgan, A International Politics and Primary Health Care in Costa Rica, @ Social Science and Medicine 1990, 30(2): 211-219.

Additional Reading:

Richard Luecke, ed., A New Dawn in Guatemala: Toward a Worldwide Health Vision, Prospect Heights, Illinois: Waveland Press, Inc., 1993.

David Werner, "Health Care and Human Dignity: A Subjective Look at Community-Based Rural Health Programs in Latin America," Contact 1980, (3): 91-105.

Lynn Morgan, Community Participation in Health: The Politics of Primary Health Care in Costa Rica, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.

November 10 The Crisis of the 1980s

Required Reading:

Ernesto Aragón et al., A The Crisis of the Welfare State and its Influence on Latin America in North South Relations, @ in Latin American Development and Public Policy, Stuart Nagel, ed., New York, St. Martin=s Press, 1994, pp. 3-19.

Ernesto Aldo Isuani, A Social Policy and Political Dynamics in Latin America, @ in Latin

American Development and Public Policy, Stuart Nagel, ed., New York, St. Martin=s Press, 1994, pp. 55-70.

Philip Musgrove, AThe Economic Crisis and its Impact on Health and Health Care in Latin America and the Caribbean,@ International Journal of Health Services, 1987, 17(3):411-441.

Asa Cristina Laurell, ACrisis, Neoliberal Health Policy, and Political Processes in Mexico,@ International Journal of Health Services, 1991, 21(3):457-470.

November 17 Health and Inequality in Latin America

Guest: Dr. José Tapia, Consultant, Pan American Health Organization

Required Reading:

Richard Wilkinson, AThe Epidemiological Transition: From Material Scarcity to Social Disadvantage?@ Daedalus 1994, 123 (4):61-77.

Tony Casas and Norberto Dachs, AInfant Mortality and Socio-Economic Inequalities in the Americas,@ 1998, mimeo.

AJoint PAHO-ECLAC Report on Health, Social Equity, and Changing Production Patterns in Latin America and the Caribbean,@ Document CSP24/20, Washington, D.C.: Pan American Health Organization, 1994, passim.

Additional Reading:

Pan American Health Organization, Health Conditions in the Americas, Washington, D.C., 1998; see individual country entries in printed or web version.

Paul Farmer, AIDS and Accusation: Haiti and the Geography of Blame, Berkeley: University of California Press, 1992.

November 24 Student Presentations

December 1 Health Reform in the 1990s- Decentralization: Disappearance of the State?

Required Reading:

José Luiz Araújo, Jr. Attempts to Decentralize in Recent Brazilian Health Policy: Issues and Problems, 1988-1994, International Journal of Health Services, 1997, 27:109-124.

World Development Report 1993: Investing in Health: World Development Indicators, New York: Oxford University Press for The World Bank, 1993, pp. 1-36, 52-71, 108-133, and 156-171.

James Petras, Imperialism and NGOs in Latin America, Monthly Review 1997, 49(7):10-27.

Tom Bossert et al., Transformation of Ministries of Health in the Era of Health Reform: The Case of Colombia, Health Policy and Planning, 1998, 13(1):59-77.

plus one article on Mexico:

Anne-Emanuelle Birn, Federalist Flirtations: The Politics and Execution of Health Services Decentralization for the Uninsured Population in Mexico, 1985-1995, Journal of Public Health Policy, forthcoming, 1999, 20 (1): 81-108.

Julio Frenk. 20 Años de Salud en México, Nexos, 1998, 21: 85-91.

Asa Cristina Laurell and Maria Elena Ortega, The Free Trade Agreement and the Mexican Health Sector, International Journal of Health Services, 1992, 22(2):331-337.

Additional Reading:

J.L. Fiedler, The Privatization of Health Care in Three Latin American Social Security Systems, Health Policy and Planning, 1996, 11(4):406-417.

Patricio Márquez et al., Chile: The Adult Health Policy Challenge, Report No. 12681-CH, Washington D.C.: The World Bank, 1994, passim.

La Seguridad Social en Colombia - Ley 100 de 1993, Bogotá, República de Colombia, Ministerio de Salud, 1993.

Strategic Orientations and Program Priorities, 1991-1994, Washington, D.C.: Pan American Health Organization, 1991.

Julia A. Walsh, A Bolivia Trip Report: Managing Health Sector Reform, @ unpublished manuscript, Harvard School of Public Health and USAID Bolivia, 1993.

Peter Sandiford and Javier Martínez, A Las Reformas del Sector Salud en Centroamérica, @ San José, Costa Rica, Instituto Centroamericano de la Salud, 1995.

Francisco E. Barreto de Oliveira, Sistemas de Seguridad Social en la Región: Problemas y Alternativas de Solución, Rio de Janeiro: Banco Interamericano de Desarrollo, 1994.

Carmelo Mesa-Lago, Changing Social Security in Latin America: Toward Alleviating the Social Costs of Economic Reform, London: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc., 1994, pp. 89-191.

Anne Mills. A Decentralization and Accountability in the Health Sector from an International Perspective: What are the Choices? @ Public Administration and Development, 1994, 14:281-292.

Russell, S. and Gilson, L., A User Fee Policies to Promote Health Service Access for the Poor: A Wolf in Sheep's Clothing? @ International Journal of Health Services, 1997, 27:359-379.

Asa Cristina Laurell, La Reforma Contra la Salud y la Seguridad Social, México, D.F., Ediciones Era, 1997.

December 8 Student presentations

December 15 Student presentations

December 22 Student Presentations/Fiesta
Papers due